



Minutes
Architectural Review Board
March 9, 2020
Council Chambers, City Hall
Fredericksburg, Virginia

Members Present

Carthon Davis III, Chair
Karen Irvin, Vice Chair
Jonathan Gerlach
Adriana Moss
Susan Pates
Sabina Weitzman

Members Absent

James Whitman

Staff

Kate Schwartz
Tammy Guseman

Chairman Davis called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

OPENING REMARKS

Chairman Davis determined that a quorum of 6 members was present, and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz confirmed that they had.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Gerlach motioned to approve the agenda as written. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Chairman Davis asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the regular meeting dated February 10, 2020. Ms. Weitzman motioned to approve the minutes as written. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0-1 with Ms. Pates abstaining.

DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Chairman Davis asked if any Board member had engaged in any *ex parte* communication on any item before the Board. No Board members had any *ex parte* communication to report.

DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Chairman Davis asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board. Ms. Weitzman reported a conflict of interest for 405 Hanover Street and would not participate in consideration of COA 2020-14.

CONSENT AGENDA

- i. **COA 2020-13** – 611 Caroline Street – Signs
- ii. **COA 2020-15** – 1017 Sophia Street – Signs
- iii. **COA 2020-16** – 1015 Caroline Street – Signs

Mr. Gerlach made a motion to approve the consent agenda as submitted. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

PUBLIC HEARING

- i. COA 2020-08** – 1020 Princess Anne Street – Dennis Sacrey requests to construct a children’s play area for the Fredericksburg Baptist Church in one corner of this parking lot, surrounded by a six-foot painted aluminum fence.

David Hahn, a minister of Fredericksburg Baptist Church, was present and offered to answer any questions the Board may have.

There were no public comments.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the request as submitted. Mr. Gerlach seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- ii. COA 2020-09** – 304 Hanover Street – Tom Frazier requests to make two wall penetrations for a ventilation system on the east side elevation of the three-story rear addition adjacent to Princess Anne Street for the Fredericksburg United Methodist Church.

The applicant was not present. There were no public comments.

Ms. Weitzman asked if there would be anything going through the window shown on the submitted diagram. Ms. Schwartz stated that her understanding was that the wall penetration would be made above the window, but they may move the sash into the down position, leave it there and run some equipment through the window opening. Ms. Weitzman noted that this may be the best option.

The Board discussed the options for screening the equipment. Ms. Irvin noted that the screen will be a substantial height of 15 feet. Ms. Schwartz noted that there is another similar example of screening behind the library which has a double-height fence to screen a cooling tower. Ms. Weitzman suggested asking the applicant to paint the installed system red to match the building brick color instead of using a screen to cover it as this option may be the least obtrusive. Ms. Schwartz suggested giving the applicant the potential option of painting the system or providing a screen for it.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the request for exterior alterations at 304 Hanover Street on the condition that the installation is either screened from Princess Anne Street or the equipment is painted with a flat, red-oxide paint. The final design must be approved by the Historic Resource Planner prior to starting the work. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- iii. COA 2020-10** – 221 Princess Anne Street - 221 Princess Anne Street – Debra Joseph requests to make alterations to this residence including enclosing an inset porch on the north side elevation of a rear one-story addition.

The applicant, Debra Joseph, was present. Ms. Joseph stated she is looking forward to completing this project as the current open porch just collects a lot of leaves and debris. Ms. Joseph inquired of the Board whether they prefer a simple or more ornate hand railing as many of the salvaged railings she has seen online are more ornate.

Ed Sandtner, 132 Caroline Street, representing HFFI, stated concerns received from an architectural historian. He said this application would be taking away the last remaining side porch from this dwelling and that, once enclosed, the ARB would no longer have purview to preserve the existing walls, windows, and doors.

Mr. Gerlach suggested that the approval of the handrail design be at the discretion of the Historic Resources Planner. Board members discussed the style of the handrail and recommended referencing neighboring

properties. Ms. Schwartz stated that information on the chosen design could be shared with the Board once selected.

Ms. Joseph said that the existing walls and windows would remain in place once the porch was enclosed. The existing door would become the new exterior door and an open doorway would remain on the interior. Board members asked for clarification of several details of the windows.

Mr. Gerlach made a motion to approve the application as recommended by staff with the following conditions: final selections, including windows and the stair railing, must be verified by the Historic Resources Planner as being in accordance with the information presented prior to building permit approval and installation; the beadboard paneling and all trim must be constructed of wood with a smooth finish; trim details at the bottom of the new wall will match those on the south side of the house; and the applicant should consider incorporating the turned posts located at each end of the porch into the new wall in order to maintain the clear delineation of this space. Ms. Moss seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- iv. COA 2020-11 - 401 Princess Anne Street – Melissa Colombo requests to make alterations to the former Janney Marshall Company warehouse in order to convert it to mixed use, including installation of new doors, replacement of missing windows, construction of an ADA-accessible ramp, and installation of railings and mechanical equipment.**

The applicant, Melissa Colombo, was present. There were no public comments.

Ms. Irvin asked if insulated panels would be added on top of the existing roof. Ms. Colombo confirmed that foam panels will be used and this height is shown in the drawings and mock-up. Ms. Irvin inquired how the foam will be camouflaged on the exterior. Ms. Colombo stated that the drip-edge and gutters will mask the change in height.

Ms. Weitzman asked if there had been talk about linear screening for the rooftop mechanical units. Ms. Colombo stated that screening may be more noticeable than none at all and she hopes that from the street the units will not be seen. She also noted that there is no other place for the units other than the roof and that the units will be placed along the roof beam so there is at least some symmetry there. Ms. Irvin noted that this will be seen from the train platform. Board members discussed various options for screening. Ms. Colombo noted that there must be adequate air flow around the units and asked how high the screening would have to be to hide the units altogether. Ms. Weitzman suggested a fence-like screening with industrial feel that would help the roof not look like just mechanical units when seen from the train station. Chairman Davis stated that the units do not need to be fully screened, but a consistent horizontal element could reduce a jagged appearance. Mr. Gerlach asked if Ms. Colombo would be willing to come back to the Board with screening options. Ms. Colombo answered affirmatively.

Chairman Davis asked if the utility bank at the rear of the building will be visible from the public right-of-way. Ms. Colombo stated that they are right on the property line as it is so any screening provided by them would end up being on City property. Ms. Schwartz stated that there is quite a bit of landscaping near the utility bank so it will be well obscured with the possibility of more landscaping there in the future.

Ms. Irvin asked if the Board could approve this application as submitted with the condition that the applicant come back with screening designs for the rooftop units. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the application as submitted with the condition that the applicant return to the Board with a proposal to screen the rooftop mechanical equipment. Mr. Gerlach seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- v. COA 2020-12 – 309 William Street - Dex Sanders requests to make alterations to this commercial building, including reconfiguring the storefront, rebuilding the pent roof on the façade, installing signs, and extending the fencing and shed roof at the rear elevation for a new restaurant.**

Architect Dex Sanders and business owner Joel Griffin were present to represent the application.

Ed Sandtner, 132 Caroline Street and representing HFFI, noted that the proposed storefront doesn't have a historic aspect and the arrangement of windows and doors on the elevation of the building seems too much to cram in between the two doors. He suggested an article for the Board members to read titled 'Keeping Up Appearances: Store Front Guidelines' which is available from Fredericksburg Main Street's website.

Chairman Davis asked if the proposed bi-fold doors would be at grade on the sidewalk. Mr. Sanders answered affirmatively. Ms. Pates questioned whether the canopy roof is flat. Mr. Sanders stated it comes out 5 ½ feet. Ms. Pates expressed concern that the building may look too modern compared to the original design. Mr. Sanders stated that the building was built in 1832 and they have tried to restore and maintain its original character. Mr. Sanders noted that this has been difficult due to a brutal 1960s renovation, but he is trying to work with what has been changed while still keeping to the original style. The door style was chosen to make them appear as close to the original 1832 doors as possible. Ms. Pates asked if cedar shakes must be used. Mr. Sanders said they were maintaining the existing material. Ms. Weitzman noted the difficulty of working with a heavily altered exterior and stated that on the two blocks of William Street all the building fronts had the same treatment. Although 309 is a more severe one, she is in support of the proposed design.

Mr. Gerlach asked if there would be a gutter on the new canopy. Mr. Griffin said it was not planned and noted that extending the canopy would help keep rainfall out of the storefront. Board members discussed the storefront glazing and recommended that it be clear and non-reflective. Mr. Sanders stated he is amiable to this request.

Chair Davis stated his support for the design and said it retains the important aspects of the earlier design, but provides interaction with the sidewalk. Ms. Irvin agreed that the applicant is improving this building. Mr. Gerlach made motion to approve the application as submitted on condition that clear, non-tinted glass is used and with the recommendation to paint or stain the wood fence. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- vi. COA 2020-14** – 405 Hanover Street - Jennifer and Kevin Riley request to construct a second story addition over the existing one-story section at the rear of this residential property.

The applicant, Jennifer Riley, was present. There were no public comments.

Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 5-0-1, with Ms. Weitzman abstaining.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

OTHER BUSINESS

A. Transmittal of Planning Commission Notice for March 11, 2020

Ms. Schwartz noted that this notice includes the first public hearing for the Creative Maker District re-zoning, but this will be continued at the next meeting. Ms. Weitzman asked if much discussion was expected. Ms. Schwartz noted that this re-zoning has received much support from the Canal Quarter District group.

B. Archaeology Ordinance

Ms. Schwartz stated that the Archaeology Ordinance was approved and will take effect on July 1, 2020. Ms. Schwartz also noted that she is working through an RFP for on-call Archaeological Services to help the City with the review of reports that come in.

C. Historic Handbook Update

Ms. Schwartz stated that the City is still working on the update of the Historic District Handbook. The first public meeting was Sunday, March 8, which went well and great feedback was received. There will be another public meeting on Thursday, March 12, at 5 p.m. in the Executive Plaza.

Ms. Schwartz noted that a request for a work session for Monday, March 23, has been submitted to review some potential alterations at the Mt. Zion Baptist Church and that Jason Gallant of Rappahannock Restoration has also requested a work session to discuss some alternative materials. Board discussion on various substitute material options followed. Meeting time of 7 p.m. was decided upon by all.

Ms. Moss asked how the Handbook survey is being distributed. Ms. Schwartz stated that it is on the City website, social media, and has been sent out by email to neighborhood groups, businesses, past applicants, and others.

ANNOUNCEMENTS AND REPORTS

Mr. Gerlach gave an update on the slave auction block and stated that Judge Deneke found in favor of the City that the City does have authority to issue their own Certificate of Appropriateness by virtue of the City Charter. The petitioner has appealed this decision to the Virginia Supreme Court and asked the Judge to issue a stay of fifteen days to prevent the City from moving the block during that time period. Ms. Schwartz noted that the Judge did not grant the temporary restraining order requested but did grant a stay instead. Mr. Gerlach stated that the stay will end on March 17. Mr. Gerlach stated he is unsure if the Virginia Supreme Court has agreed to take the case or not. Ms. Schwartz added that at this point the petition is requesting the Supreme Court of Virginia to grant a stay while the appeal is being considered. They will have a fifteen-day period to submit the petition and if they do so, the City has a 7-day period in which to respond. There would be no oral arguments. Ms. Schwartz noted that this is a separate appeal.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Davis adjourned the meeting at 8:24 p.m.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'CD III', is positioned above a horizontal line.

Carthon Davis III, Chair